**Introduction**

During the summer of 2017, the Board of Education directed the Accountability, Research, and Equity (ARE) Division to identify and examine inequities in Human Resources’ (HR) policies, practices, and procedures through the Equity and Diversity Impact Assessment (EDIA). This EDIA examined the extent to which HR’s policies, practices, and procedures influence the recruitment, hiring, and retention of effective teachers of color. ARE worked in partnership with the MPS HR Division and the EDIA Committee to complete the HR EDIA.

**Human Resources Division**

HR aims “to ensure high academic achievement of all Minneapolis Public Schools (MPS) students by recruiting, selecting, retaining, and supporting a diverse and highly talented staff.” The HR Division is composed of four departments: Talent Acquisition, Talent Management, Employee Relations, and Human Resources Information Systems (HRIS). The Talent Acquisition team is responsible for identifying, attracting, and on-boarding top talent, and the Talent Management team oversees performance management and Quality Compensation (Q Comp). Employee Relations focuses on discipline, grievances, contract administration, and contract negotiations. Finally, the HRIS team is responsible for maintaining HR’s personnel data and systems. More information about HR is available on their website.

**Methods Overview**

ARE collected and analyzed data from eight different data sources. Each of the sources are described in Table 1 on the following page. The first column of this table identifies the data source, and the next column provides a brief description, including what this source provided and, in some cases, why it was collected. The third column identifies important dates related to this data source; for sources collected by ARE (i.e., surveys, focus groups), this column provides dates of administration and for archival (i.e., existing) data, this column identifies the school years represented in the resource. Finally, the last column provides detail about who is represented in each source, including number of participants and/or positions represented.

**Current Report**

Preliminary findings were presented to the Board of Education on February 27, 2018 (a full slide deck is available here). The current report provides a comprehensive summary of findings from the HR EDIA.

---

**Considerations**

This report **can** support:
- Awareness of recruitment, hiring, and retention practices and process in MPS
- Understanding of barriers identified by stakeholders regarding the challenged MPS faces in recruiting, hiring, and retaining teachers of color
- Understanding of strategies attempted by MPS leaders—to overcome these barriers
- Inferences about the thoughts and experiences of school leaders, teachers, of color, and Human Resources staff

This report **cannot** support:
- Awareness of how recent changes to the District’s budget and the state’s licensure requirements impact the recruitment, hiring, and retention of teachers of color in MPS
- Comprehensive understanding of teachers, school leaders, and Human Resources’ perceptions and experiences
- Understanding of other stakeholders’ perceptions, such as union stewards, white teachers, and District leaders
- Comprehensive knowledge of strategies—attempted by stakeholders across the District—to overcome barriers to recruiting, hiring, and retaining teachers of color in MPS
### Table 1. EDIA Methods Overview

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Data Source</th>
<th>Description</th>
<th>Dates</th>
<th>People Reached</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td><strong>Focus Groups</strong></td>
<td>Four focus groups were conducted with MPS teachers of color to examine and document teachers’ lived experiences as people of color in MPS schools.</td>
<td>June 11 – June 13, 2018</td>
<td>33 MPS teachers of color.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Interviews</strong></td>
<td>Interviews were conducted with MPS teachers of color who were unable to attend focus groups. These interviews used the same questions as the focus groups described above.</td>
<td>June 5 – July 6, 2018</td>
<td>10 MPS teachers of color.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>School Leaders</strong></td>
<td>Twenty interviews were conducted with school leaders to explore barriers, strategies, and solutions to recruiting, hiring, and retaining teachers of color.</td>
<td>February 15 – March 30, 2018</td>
<td>25 school leaders, including 16 Principals and 9 Assistant Principals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Survey</strong></td>
<td>A survey was administered to leaders who did not participate in the interviews. These interviews used the same questions as the interviews described above.</td>
<td>April 12 – April 30, 2018</td>
<td>51 school leaders, including 28 Principals and 23 Assistant Principals.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Human Resources</strong></td>
<td>HR’s exit survey is an ongoing survey accessible to all exiting MPS staff. This survey is available through the HR intranet page; in some cases, it is also emailed directly to staff. Responses were only analyzed for staff on a teacher contract who exited MPS during the 2016-2017 or 2017-2018 school years.</td>
<td>SY 2016-2017, SY 2017-2018</td>
<td>195 exiting teachers, including 40 (21%) teachers of color.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Group Interview</strong></td>
<td>One group interview, conducted with Directors in the HR Department, examined the role of HR Directors in the recruitment, hiring, and retention of teachers of color.</td>
<td>August 31, 2018</td>
<td>The Director of Labor Relations, Director of Talent Acquisition, and Director of Talent Management.</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Partial EDIA Forms</strong></td>
<td>The Partial EDIA form, completed by HR, documented the Division’s processes and procedures as well as their barriers and strategies for recruiting, hiring, and retaining teachers of color.</td>
<td>SY 2017-2018</td>
<td>N/A</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Personnel Data</strong></td>
<td>Personnel data were provided by the Human Resources Information Systems (HRIS) Department. This data documented hiring, retention, and exit data disaggregated by race/ethnicity.</td>
<td>SY 2013-2014, SY 2014-2015, SY 2015-2016, SY 2016-2017, SY 2017-2018</td>
<td>All MPS staff on a teacher contract.</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Human Resources EDIA: Roadmap

This roadmap provides a visual overview of findings from the perspective of MPS teachers of color.
Recruitment and Hiring

This roadmap provides a visual overview of findings from the perspective of MPS teachers of color.

Candidates follow one of two paths to become a teacher in MPS: (A) obtain a traditional teacher license from the state of Minnesota or (B) obtain licensure through an alternative licensure pathway or program. Because systemic barriers and MPS’ passive recruitment strategies have produced a limited pool of candidates with a traditional teaching license (1), MPS leans on alternative licensure pathways and programs when hiring a racially and ethnically diverse teaching staff. Although these alternative pathways and programs were designed to make teaching more accessible to diverse candidates, they often require extensive time and resources.

Regardless of their path, MPS’ teacher candidates of color face an uphill battle during hiring (2), the unintended effect of certain contractual obligations and MPS’ decentralized hiring process. Ultimately, however, candidates who make it through this process are welcomed into MPS as classroom teachers (C).
**Finding 1:** MPS has access to a limited pool of teacher candidates of color.

Stakeholders identified two barriers contributing to MPS’ limited pool of candidates of color: **systemic barriers** and **passive recruitment strategies**. Each of these themes are described in greater detail below.

---

**Systemic Barriers**

Both Human Resources and school leaders feel that largely white teacher preparation programs play a role in MPS’ inability to recruit teacher candidates of color. Human Resources, school leaders, and teachers of color also acknowledge the impact of Minnesota’s rigid licensure requirements, which may prevent people of color from securing teaching positions both in MPS and across the state.

---

**Passive Recruitment Strategies**

Rather than actively seeking teacher candidates of color, Human Resources recruits more passively, relying on local career fairs, job search websites, university partnerships, and the “MPS community.” Few school leaders recruit teacher candidates, for they feel recruitment is the responsibility of the Human Resources Department. Nevertheless, teachers of color are frustrated by MPS’ passive approach, for they feel it conveys a lack of commitment to hiring racially and ethnically diverse candidates.
**Finding 2:** Teacher candidates of color face an uphill battle in hiring due to District and contractual policies and practices.

The hiring process is challenging for Human Resources, school leaders, and teachers alike, largely due to certain contractual obligations and District hiring practices. These challenges are described in greater detail below.

**Contractual Obligations**

Certain contractual obligations, particularly those associated with the internal hiring process, unintentionally create obstacles for teachers of color; these obstacles are evident to both school leaders and Human Resources. The internal hiring process – including seniority, Interview and Select, and Matching – prevents Human Resources from posting most positions externally, leaving MPS’ largely white workforce in place. The internal hiring process also poses challenges for school leaders, who feel unable to “shield” their less senior teachers of color during budget cuts, are frustrated by the ways in which Interview and Select delays Human Resources’ hiring timeline, and feel that Matching prevents them from intentionally hiring staff to meet their buildings’ needs.

**Hiring Practices**

Hiring is a decentralized process in MPS. Whereas Human Resources is responsible for managing vacancies, screening applicants, and submitting official offers, school leaders are responsible for conducting interviews and selecting acceptable candidates. School leaders found this process to be problematic, for they feel that Human Resources’ hiring timeline is slow and their communication is lacking. Teachers of color were also challenged by Human Resources’ lacking communication, and desired additional support navigating the system through the hiring process.
Teacher Experience

This roadmap provides a visual overview of findings from the perspective of MPS teachers of color.

Once they are hired, teachers of color *endure a challenging work environment (3)*. Teachers face persistent negative interactions, isolation, and bias—ranging from microaggressions to more serious behaviors—from colleagues, leaders, and the larger school community alike. Neither school leaders nor Human Resources are able to provide teachers with sufficient technical or adaptive supports, making them feel unsupported and unwelcomed.

When teachers of color attempt to confront these inequities, they feel silenced and targeted, an experience that is only enhanced among non-tenured staff. Ultimately, these negative experiences and interactions have a compounding and detrimental effect on teachers’ personal and professional well-being and success.
Finding 3: MPS Teachers of color endure a challenging work environment.

Teachers of color endure a challenging environment at MPS, characterized by **persistent negative interactions, isolation, insufficient technical and adaptive supports, and job insecurity**. These challenges are described in greater detail below.

**Persistent Negative Interactions**

Teachers of color feel they are assigned different, and sometimes additional, roles based on their race or ethnicity; this includes being directed to High Priority schools, being responsible for teaching “tough” students of color, and/or taking on the role of Behavior Dean. Teachers of color also feel as though they are held to a different standard than their white colleagues, while simultaneously receiving messages that they are not meeting these expectations. Finally, teachers experience consistent negative interactions with the school community; these interactions range from microaggressions to more serious forms of bias.

Human Resources and school leaders are aware of these issues. Although some leaders are working to address this challenging climate, their efforts are not always well received by the school community.

**Isolation**

Because they work in racially isolated spaces, teachers of color often feel excluded and unwelcome in their buildings. Given these persistent, negative, and exclusionary interactions, many teachers of color feel responsible for modeling respectful and inclusive interactions with their white colleagues. Ultimately, these experiences perpetuate teachers’ feelings of isolation in the workplace.

School leaders are aware that their teachers of color are isolated, and see connections between the building demographics and the intensity of teachers’ feelings.
Insufficient Technical Supports

Teachers of color, school leaders, and Human Resources are challenged by MPS’ limited ability to offer technical supports. Human Resources provides basic, standardized information to new teachers, but leans on school leaders to provide more detailed, site-specific information. Both teachers of color and school leaders were dissatisfied with this onboarding process; teachers of color found the process to be limited in scope and poorly timed, and school leaders found the District’s system to be insufficient in preparing new staff for their roles.

Human Resources does not provide training or resources designed specifically for teachers of color. School leaders are challenged by these limited opportunities, as they feel teachers of color require additional training that they cannot provide.

Insufficient Adaptive Supports

Teachers of color feel unsupported by their leaders, though some teachers feel that the District, rather than their leader, is to blame.

Neither Human Resources nor school leaders feel that they are able to provide teachers of color with sufficient adaptive resources, or supports to navigate systems and structures. Human Resources provides training and resources for school-based leadership teams (e.g., Equity and Engagement), expecting these teams to bring relevant information to their staff.

Job Insecurity

Teachers of color feel targeted by their colleagues – and, in some cases, school leaders – when they “speak their truth” to confront bias and inequity in their buildings. These feelings are enhanced among teachers who do not yet have tenure, as they are more likely to be excessed during the budget tie-out process. Ultimately, teachers’ lived experiences intersect with the weight of certain contractual obligations, and produce a sense of job insecurity among many teachers of color across MPS.

School leaders know that teachers of color feel targeted by their colleagues. School leaders agree that certain contractual obligations create job insecurity among many teachers of color, and often struggle to “shield” these staff.
Retention and Exit

This roadmap provides a visual overview of findings from the perspective of MPS teachers of color.

The compounding effect of teachers’ negative experiences make them feel that **MPS is an unwelcoming place to work (4)**. This leaves teachers at a professional crossroads: they can either (A) remain in their building in hopes it will improve, (B) remain in the District but take on a new role in a new building, or (C) exit the District entirely. Teachers who choose to remain in their building may face the same challenging environment they have in the past (3). Similarly, teachers who choose to stay with MPS but hope to transfer buildings must complete the hiring process again knowing that they may still face similar, negative experiences both during hiring (2) and in their new site (3). Ultimately, this challenging cycle makes it more difficult for MPS to retain teachers of color.
Finding 4: The compounding effect of these negative experiences makes MPS an unwelcoming place to work.

Teachers’ overwhelmingly negative experiences in the District make it challenging for MPS to retain teachers of color. This finding is described in greater detail below.

Many teachers of color feel that MPS’ white dominant culture discredits the ways they think and act. Teachers of color also question MPS’ commitment to equity and diversity. These negative feelings and experiences have a compounding and detrimental effect on teachers’ satisfaction and well-being, driving them to leave their site, and sometimes, the District. Regardless of their personal feelings, however, teachers are overwhelmingly concerned about how these dynamics harm the student experience.

Though both District and site-based retention rates are high, retention rates are noticeably lower among teachers of color. Both school leaders and Human Resources are aware of these trends. School leaders feel that their teachers’ inability to be their whole selves at work makes it challenging to retain them. Human Resources feels largely unable to support teacher retention because of the decentralized nature of their work. Instead, Human Resources believes staff retention is dependent on department and school leaders.
HR Response
Human Resources EDIA Proposal

Overview
Based on the findings of the EDIA process, the EDIA Committee provided MPS with feedback on ways to address the challenges identified. Human Resources (HR) and Accountability, Research, and Equity (ARE) worked collaboratively to develop an initial action plan based on the report and the Committee feedback.

This initial plan includes many technical solutions, but the goal is that it will lead to the adaptive changes in culture that are needed for long term success in making MPS a welcoming environment for our staff of color. We will begin with partial implementation in SY19 with full implementation in SY20.

HR and ARE presented this proposed plan to the EDIA Committee and the committee’s additional feedback is embedded within.

Ongoing HR Commitments
- **Continue to develop pipelines and career trajectories** for critical and hard-to-staff positions across the District, including our Special Education Residency program
- **Centralize and enhance onboarding** to attract, excite and retain strong staff
- **Design recruitment and retention training** for leaders
- **Create and activate recruitment networks and partnerships** with our schools and communities
- **Increasing exit reflection session participation** to identify ways we can better support staff

Proposed MPS HR & Department Efforts

Human Resources: Hiring and Recruitment
- **Add an additional Recruitment and Retention Coordinator** to engage deeply and authentically with our broad MPS community, and provide feedback from community stakeholders to HR on ways that we can continually improve. *
- **Expand our recruitment budget** to more explicitly emphasize active, community-focused and out of state recruitment efforts. *
- **Deepen and expand the extent to which we train hiring managers and interview teams** on implicit bias in the hiring process, in order to ensure that all candidates are being treated fairly and consistently, and helping to ensure that we can continue to diversify our workforce.
- **Reframe our annual higher education partnership event to showcase and amplify voices of teachers of color**, to help our preparation partners better understand and prepare candidates for the authentic experiences of educators of color in MPS.
- **Investigate how new rules with the Professional Educator Licensing and Standards Board (PELSB) regarding including teachers of color as part of the definition of “hard-to-fill” licensure areas** can support our broader effort to increase the diversity of our new teacher hires.
- **Articulate how SOEI and SOESL (performance management rubrics for teachers and principals) indicators demonstrate equitable practices** in order to embed and crosswalk the language of equity into how we talk about, give feedback around, and measure effective practice.

*These action steps will require additional financial resources
Human Resources: Support and Retention:

- **Hire a Mediator** dedicated fully to helping employees resolve issues that are affecting their job satisfaction without having these issues rise to the level of formal Human Resources or Equal Opportunity Office processes. This new role would create a safe space for employees to share their thoughts, provide a structure for mediation between employees, and help maintain a positive staff culture across the district.

- **Offer in-person feedback and reflection sessions** to all interested teachers of color who are leaving the district in order to gain critical insight into the reasons that we are losing talented staff.

- **Increase levels of mentorship support** for teachers of color in MPS. This could take the form of hiring additional PAR mentors for supporting early-career teachers, but could also represent new or innovative models for ongoing mentorship support for teachers of color.

- **Emphasize the elimination of disparities** as an explicit focus in contract negotiations, particularly with our teacher’s contract. Specifically, the EDIA Committee identified areas such as the internal hiring process and seniority-based layoffs as potential places for improvement.

Departments of Academics & Accountability, Research, and Equity:

- **Ensure all MPS leadership complete the IDI Assessment and engage in ongoing equity professional development** (Cabinet, Executive Directors, Directors, Principals, APs)*

- **Add additional equity coaches** to assist school leaders in supporting positive and inclusive climate*

- **Train principals on EDIA process** and create tools for small-scale, school-based EDIA processes. Doing so will allow the effects and impacts of the EDIA process to unfold at the site level.

- **Examine and leverage the new district calendar**, which presents new opportunities to provide additional professional development around equity to teachers at the beginning of each school year.

- **Support affinity groups for teachers of color** and provide avenues to access system leaders and decision makers.

- **Review current staff and student survey data** (from the 5E, spring survey, and others), and triangulate findings with HR data to inform improvements to school culture and climate by understanding both the student and staff experience with school environments across the district.

Timeline and Accountability:

Partial implementation of the plan will begin this school year, with additional investments and implementation for SY20. HR and ARE will meet with the EDIA committee quarterly to provide updates on implementation and gather feedback to inform and modify the plan.

*These action steps will require additional financial resources
## Human Resources EDIA Proposal

### PHASE 1 (SY 18-19): Partial Implementation

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Recruitment &amp; Hiring</th>
<th>Support &amp; Retention</th>
<th>Accountability</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Deepen and expand the extent to which we train hiring managers</td>
<td>• Continue to develop pipelines and career trajectories</td>
<td>Quarterly meetings with the EDIA Committee to provide updates on implementation and collect feedback</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Reframe our annual higher education partnership event to showcase and amplify voices of teachers of color</td>
<td>• Design recruitment and retention training</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Investigate new rules with the Professional Educator Licens- ing and Standards Board (PELSB)</td>
<td>• Offer in-person feedback and reflection sessions</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Create and activate recruitment networks and partnerships</td>
<td>• Emphasize the elimination of disparities in teacher contract negotiations</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### PHASE 2 (SY 19-20): Full Implementation

<p>| | | |</p>
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th></th>
<th></th>
<th></th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>• Hire an additional Recruitment and Retention Coordinator to engage deeply and authentically with our broad MPS community</td>
<td>• Examine and leverage the new district calendar to provide PD to all teachers</td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Expand our recruitment efforts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Centralize and enhance onboarding</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>• Leverage changes to teacher licensure to expand outreach and recruitment efforts</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>

### Support & Retention

- Continue to develop pipelines and career trajectories
- Design recruitment and retention training
- Offer in-person feedback and reflection sessions
- Emphasize the elimination of disparities in teacher contract negotiations
- Support affinity groups for teachers of color
- Review current staff and student survey data
- Increasing exit survey participation
- Train principals on EDIA process and create tools for small-scale, school-based EDIA processes
- Train school leaders on IDI and equitable practices

*These action steps will require additional financial resources*